

## Summary of the Responses Received, and Appraisal of Views Expressed

1. The points of view received as part of the consultation are set out in italics and have been grouped according to the points raised where appropriate.
2. The Council's response to each point can be seen underneath, under the heading "Appraisal of views expressed."

### Estyn

3. A response from Estyn included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 5)
  - *the Council has considered the likely effect of local developments on school places carefully, and has considered the capacity, admission number, surplus capacity and projected demand for schools affected by the proposal. They predict the need to expand capacity at Pentyrch Primary School, despite the creation of new schools to address the increase in housing stock in the area.*
  - *the proposer sees the establishment of a nursery as a means of enhancing the opportunity to appropriately address individual developmental and cultural needs as well as establishing strong and effective parental links from the earliest opportunity.*
  - *the council considered other alternatives to the preferred proposal fairly.*
  - *Estyn is of the opinion that the proposal is likely to maintain the current standards in terms of education, provision, and leadership and management.*

### Appraisal of views expressed

4. The Council acknowledges the conclusions of Estyn on the overall merits of the proposal and notes the risks they identified in relation to the construction period.
5. The Council has significant experience in the successful delivery of building projects on the sites of occupied schools resulting from the progression of a large and growing school organisation programme generated by the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Programme.
6. Any building work carried out on the Pentyrch Primary School site would be managed effectively in consultation with the school to ensure that sufficient accommodation is available, the full curriculum continues to be delivered and that high education, safety and safeguarding standards are maintained.

7. Any building works would be kept separate from the parts of the site being used by the school, DBS checks would be undertaken, and on-site security measures implemented to ensure complete separation.
8. Construction disruption concerns would be addressed within the planning conditions which would be expected to restrict construction traffic access outside school journey times.

### **Pentyrch Primary School Governing Body**

9. The Governing Body of Pentyrch Primary School stated they were supportive of the proposals. Their response included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 5)
  - *the expansion of the school will provide security for the future and ensure that we are able to continue delivering an excellent standard of education in the local community.*
  - *the nursery provision means that children will get the best possible start to their life in education and the school community will continue to grow.*
  - *the consultation has also highlighted some items for consideration: increase of traffic and parking within the area; impact on existing nursery; adequate rooms and school hall to accommodate the extra pupils; adequate staff facilities; building works do not impact on existing pupils.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

10. The Council welcomes the Governing Body's support for the proposal.
11. The Council recognises that the proposal could increase issues with traffic and transport in the vicinity of the school.
12. The Council's Local Development Plan (2006-2026) includes a target of 50% of all journeys to be made by sustainable transport. Minimising the proportion of school journeys made by car and maximising opportunities for travel to school by active and sustainable modes can make an important contribution to achieving this target and reducing pressures on the transport network at peak times.
13. Increasing travel to school by active modes will have a positive impact on children's health and wellbeing and will support the delivery of key actions and outcomes under Goal 5 the Council's Child Friendly City Strategy (2018), which relates to ensuring access to safe outdoor environments for formal and informal play, and active travel to school.
14. The proposals will include measures identified by a Transport Assessment to maximise active travel. Expected improvements would be in the provision for walking, scooting and cycling with appropriate road crossings in Pentyrch.

These would be expected to reduce the proportion travelling by car from within the village.

15. The Council's current Corporate Plan includes a commitment to every school in Cardiff developing an Active Travel Plan. Such a plan will identify actions by the school to support and encourage active travel to school and also any improvements to on-site and off-site infrastructure required to facilitate active journeys.
16. The proposals will include measures identified by a Transport Assessment to maximise this active travel. Expected improvements would be in the provision for walking, scooting and cycling with appropriate road crossings in Pentyrch. These would be expected to reduce the proportion travelling by car from within the village.
17. Parking restrictions are likely to be put in place to discourage short distance car travel and maximise active travel to school. Consideration would be given to identify a suitable Park and Stride facility for any who need to drive from further afield.
18. Potential provision of wrap-around nursery care would be expected to reduce overall trips as it would enable some families to combine trips accompanying siblings of nursery and school age.
19. Officers from the Council's Transport Vision Policy & Strategy team will work closely with colleagues within the planning and education teams and the Governing Body and Senior Leadership Team of the school to further develop the Active Travel Plan and to mitigate problems were possible.
20. The potential financial impact on the local private nursery of establishing nursery provision at Pentyrch Primary School is acknowledged by the Council and this was highlighted in the consultation information published by the Council.
21. The introduction of nursery provision in this area would be a benefit to many in the local community and would support the 21st Century Schools Programme Vision for Cardiff which aims to have schools of the right size and in the right place. It seeks to place schools at the heart of their communities with a shared responsibility for all children and young people in the area.
22. The potential financial impact on the local private nursery of establishing nursery provision at Pentyrch Primary School is acknowledged by the Council and this was highlighted in the consultation information published by the Council.
23. The impact on the private nursery may be mitigated through a number of measures which have been discussed at length with the owner during the consultation period. These may include each setting offering alternate sessions (e.g. school nursery class sessions in morning or afternoon only) which would allow the nursery to operate as a wrap-around childcare setting, and potentially

the sharing of the proposed nursery class accommodation on the school site. Such arrangements have operated successfully on other school sites, and the arrangements have allowed families to access the nursery education offer and wrap-around childcare.

24. 'The childcare offer for Wales' provides working parents with a mixture of childcare and early education for children aged three or four. This would allow parents to access a nursery class place in a school of up to 12.5 hours and to receive funding for wrap-around childcare for up to 17.5 hours.
25. Several discussions with the private nursery have been held during the consultation period. The school has also been active in discussions with the private nursery regarding opportunities to expand their offer to provide for other groups should they be interested to do so to cater for the wider primary age group operating from the Pentyrch Primary School site in order to enhance the current offer available to families in the village and wider community.
26. Detailed designs for any new building works or adaptations would be agreed with the Headteacher and Governing Body, if the proposals are progressed to implementation. The input of children and young people into developing the site would be integral to project implementation at all stages.
27. Concerns around the impact of the construction phase on pupils' learning are addressed in paragraphs 5-8.

### **Pentyrch Community Council**

28. The Community Council responded to the consultation stating that they were in support of the proposal and understood the need for Pentyrch Primary School to remain sustainable. (A copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 5)
29. They did however raise the following concerns:
  - *the proposed increase in pupil numbers will greatly increase the traffic and parking.*
  - *Bronllwyn traffic flow is already significantly affected at school drop-off and pick-up time and safety for all users is a major concern.*
  - *the Community Council is pleased to see that support for the existing nursery is part of the consultation plan; it has been an important part of the community for 40 years, contributes a significant proportion towards the income of the village hall and plays a key role in the community.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

30. The Council welcomes the support of Pentyrch Community Council for the proposal.

31. Concerns around traffic and transport implications are addressed at paragraphs 12-19.
32. Concerns around any detrimental effect on the existing nursery provider are addressed at paragraphs 20-25.

### **Pentyrch Nursery**

33. The proprietor of Pentyrch Nursery submitted a response to state they did not support either part of the proposal: to expand the school, nor establish nursery provision at the school (A copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 5)
34. The following points were expressed highlighting their concerns with the proposal:
  - *the increase in provision is not for the benefit of the residents of the village but with the hope of attracting pupils from the new developments.*
  - *this will undoubtedly lead to a large increase in traffic at pickup and drop off times, leading to a significant impact to air quality and pollution around the school at these times.*
  - *parking will become a major issue as there will be extra vehicles at pickup and drop off times; nursery provision on site means this would occur 3-4 times per day. This will have a knock-on effect on road safety and will create additional risks for the local children walking to school. There isn't sufficient parking to accommodate this proposal and people will undoubtedly park irresponsibly as a consequence.*
  - *the proposed relocation of the surgery will have an impact; village residents attempting to access the surgery will be competing with school parents from outside the village through the lanes, creating traffic misery.*
  - *Groeswen Primary School is due to open on the same date as the proposal at Pentyrch Primary School. Parents will be faced with battling the lanes to attend Pentyrch or alternatively sending their children to a new state of the art primary school and nursery with much better access.*
  - *if the proposal was successful and a nursery was established at the school, then the existing nursery which has been in the village for over 40 years will cease to exist as it would not be financially viable to continue operation.*
  - *Pentyrch Nursery has consistently provided high quality early years education as demonstrated by its numerous positive inspection reports from both ESTYN and CIW.*
  - *all children over 3 years old who want a nursery place would have to attend 5 days per week as there is no flexibility for a school-based nursery to offer less days. This removes a parent's ability to select less days if they feel it*

*isn't right for their child and their development or to suit other childcare commitments.*

- there would be no provision for 2-year-olds to attend nursery within the village meaning children will miss out on the benefits of attending nursery and socialising with other children every year.*
- Nowhere in the document is there a cost benefit analysis. An entirely new nursery will need to be built at the school as there is no current provision. This will require it to be fully equipped with equipment, resources and staff as well as the cost of the building itself.*
- Replacing the existing high quality private nursery provision with an unproven nursery that only accepts over 3's within the school that lacks flexibility is a backward step and will lead to another loss of amenities to the village.*
- The existing private nursery could be relocated to the newly built nursery on the school site to continue to provide sessional childcare in the morning session. This would allow the school to provide the education element of the childcare offer in the afternoons.*
- This would provide potentially all-day nursery for 3-year-olds and would maintain provision for 2-year-olds in the village which would mean greater flexibility for parents in regards to their childcare needs. This would also have the benefit of introducing children to the school setting at the earliest opportunity.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

35. Projection figures of pupil numbers from several catchments were published in the consultation document. This data is based on the most recent information supplied by the NHS in August 2021, and recent patterns of migration and take up of places.
36. The data which is based on existing housing, shows that whilst there is an increasing level of surplus English-medium primary school places projected in the wider area, there are few surplus places in the catchment area of Pentyrch Primary School. The projected numbers are greater than the existing Published Admission Number of 20.
37. It is anticipated that in the short term, the new housing developments will impact the take up of places at the next nearest schools with many being highly subscribed.
38. Pentyrch Primary School may also attract some pupils from the Goitre Fach development, which lies within the catchment area of the school. As there is no safe walking route from the development at present, learners would be entitled to free home to school transport to the nearest available school place.

Should learners access a place at Pentyrch Primary School, it is anticipated that this would be accommodated with only one or two vehicles.

39. Concerns around traffic and transport implications are addressed at paragraphs 12-19.
40. The Council acknowledges that current nursery provision within the village is well respected by many and recognises the positive inspections that it has received. However, only a small proportion of children in the catchment area of the school take up places at this private nursery.
41. Children aged three to four years are entitled to a part-time nursery place from the start of the term after they have turned three. They must attend nursery class for at least five half days a week.
42. The establishment of nursery provision at the school would provide a consistent approach to teaching and planning, to develop continuity and progression in children's learning from the age of three, and to contribute to raising standards across the school.
43. The following benefits would be expected to result from the establishment of nursery provision at the school:
  - Continuity of provision which reflects the ethos and culture of the school.
  - The development of strong and effective parental links from the earliest possible opportunity can be supported.
  - Ease of transition for a nursery-aged child when promoting to Reception class (where Reception admission application has been successful).
  - Early identification of vulnerable groups. This will mean that the needs of children can be identified as early as possible.
  - It would provide an opportunity for children to attend nursery at the same site as their older siblings. This should impact positively on parents' time and reduce the logistical difficulties that seeking an alternative childcare provider may cause.
  - By having an early years unit within our school, our pupils' well-being and learning will be advantaged. Continuity and progression between Early Years and Foundation Phase will be secured, enhancing the opportunity to appropriately address individual developmental and cultural needs.
44. Funding to expand Pentyrch Primary School has been secured through S106 contributions. Any building works or adaptations required will need design/cost development and will need to consider a range of financial aspects, including this s106 funding available alongside the affordability and prioritisation of this project against ongoing Education capital schemes.
45. The Council welcomes the opportunity to engage further with the owner of Pentyrch Nursery to discuss options to provide a range of childcare solutions for the entire community of Pentyrch.

## Other Responses Received

### Traffic Implications

- *There is no adequate parking on Bronllwyn for cars dropping off children but there are dedicated parking/disabled bays at Pentyrch Village Hall for the parents of nursery children.*
- *Parking outside school is already a hazard, making it impossible for cars to pass through the main road through the village.*
- *The roads from the new housing developments are very poor – all are unlit and without pavements for large parts of the journey. There have been two fatalities on Heol Pant Y Gored – one in 2010 and another in 2013.*
- *The extra traffic and pollution the new nursery will bring into our small village is a huge safety concern for all the children who actually live in Pentyrch.*
- *The added traffic for the new nursery and the proposed new location of Pentyrch surgery will potentially cause a huge traffic conflict between the two, in itself causing huge health and safety issues.*
- *The school pickup already causes chaos due to traffic and encouraging people to send their children here from further afield will exasperate that.*
- *The site is not big enough as a start. The village is used as a cut through - this will generate extra traffic. The main road cannot cope with this or buses parking in the road.*
- *This proposal is not for the benefit of the village and will lead to disruptive traffic and parking in the village.*

### Appraisal of views expressed

46. Concerns around traffic and transport implications are addressed at paragraphs 12-19.

### Impact on Pentyrch Nursery

- *I'd be sad to see the closure of the current Pentyrch Nursery*
- *I hugely object to the plans for the new Pentyrch nursery in its current form, there is lack of consultation and huge implications for the existing incredible nursery and its staff as well as the village itself.*
- *The existing Nursery has been going for over 40 years and is an established, well achieving and very special educational setting that allows children from 2*



*years old to experience independence, creativity, friendship and to also learn the importance of the values of village life.*

- *The expansion of the school will mean the closure of Pentyrch Nursery, which will mean there will be no flexible childcare within the area for my children. Pentyrch Nursery allows you to choose what days your child attends in relation to what suits them, their ability and your work commitments.*
- *There is a nursery in the village which you will put out of business.*
- *A nursery based at the Village Hall has provided educational services for over forty years. The present owner has been established for well over ten years and has built up a good working relationship with the school.*
- *A private nursery has been established in the village hall for over 40 years. The current nursery is consistently inspected at a very high level, and it offers more provision than the proposed school based one. There is a very close working relationship with primary and nursery and they are less than 200 yards apart.*
- *Existing nursery provision at P. V. H. is flexible. Parents can pick and choose the amount of daily provision they want. Pentyrch Nursery has created a good relationship with the school as most children feed into reception class. Why destroy that relationship?*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

47. Concerns around any detrimental effect on the existing nursery provider are addressed at paragraphs 20-25 and 45.

### Impact on Village Hall

- *There would be a huge impact on the viability of the village hall, pre-covid the income from nursery was about 40% of total lettings.*
- *Pentyrch Village Hall is a registered Charitable Trust owned by the residents of the Village – (the Trustees being Pentyrch Community Council). Reduction in income of the hall may lead to its demise unless adequate income can be sourced from elsewhere.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

48. The Council acknowledges concerns expressed about the village hall.
49. Concerns around any detrimental effect on the existing nursery provider are addressed at paragraphs 20-25 and 45.

### Pupil Numbers

- *There are definite advantages of improving the school buildings and capacity of staffing but I am worried about class sizes increasing.*
- *What about the proposed new schools to be built on the Llantrisant Road? Pentyrch school would then be left with surplus space and staff.*
- *Once nursery provision has been fully supplied in the new housing development parents will not enrol children in Pentyrch. The majority of parents enrol children in the nursery that feeds a school that has a good Care Inspectorate Report. Until Pentyrch School improves further it will face difficulties maintaining, never mind increasing, its attraction for parents.*
- *The village hasn't expanded so no need.*
- *There is absolutely no need at the current time. The NOR in primaries are at the lowest level for years.*
- *Why would parents travelling from the new developments bring children to Pentyrch when they will drive past nursery provision at The Laurels or Little Haven?*
- *Do not expend capital on the creation of a nursery when there is adequate provision for nurseries at Pentyrch Nursery*
- *The new estates have been promised their own schools which will then leave Pentyrch searching for pupils. This doesn't feel necessary and I feel the money could be better spent in other ways to improve the education provision in the area.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

50. There is a collective surplus of primary school English-medium places across the wider area of Pentyrch, Creigiau and Radyr and Morganstown. However, the number of children resident in the catchment area of Pentyrch Primary School, enrolled in an English-medium primary school, exceeds the capacity of the school.
51. Additional school places will be required in the short term as new housing is developed.
52. The Goitre Fach development, within the catchment area of Pentyrch Primary School is projected to produce a yield of circa 10 pupils for each year group of which an average of 8 pupils would take up places in English-medium schools taking account of the most recent city-wide take up. A range of 6-10 pupils requiring places is assumed to take account of fluctuation.
53. The primary school that will serve the Plasdwr development, Groeswen Primary School, is due to open in September 2023. The 2 form entry school will open with a phased approach, initially offering 30 English-medium and 30 Welsh-

medium places in Reception and 15 English-medium and 15 Welsh-medium places in Years 1 and 2.

54. This phased approach will limit the impact to other schools in the wider area, such as Pentyrch Primary School.
55. Previous trends for take up of places in this locality shows that a significant proportion of pupils take up places in a school that is not their catchment school. Pupils' resident outside of Cardiff are also able to take up places at Cardiff schools, subject to sufficient places being available, and may meet higher oversubscription criteria such as residing in closer proximity than some Cardiff applicants who may also be out of the catchment area of that school.
56. Small schools such as Pentyrch Primary School face significant financial challenges in balancing their budget. The annual revenue funding allocation for each individual school comprises a combination of fixed lump sum elements and per pupil funding amounts based on the number of pupils within the school.
57. The proposed expansion would provide a sustainable balance in the supply of and demand for places in the village of Pentyrch and the Goitre Fach development.
58. Expanding the school to a one form entry primary school permits greater flexibility and opportunity for pupils owing to an extended, more enhanced and secure financial resource base.
59. A one form entry school would also provide a greater degree of stability at all levels of leadership, including maintaining a full and stable complement of school governors.
60. The ability to employ more teaching and support staff for a slightly larger school, would also allow the school to provide a wider range of curriculum expertise.
61. Concerns around nursery provision are addressed at paragraphs 47-50.
62. Concerns around costs are addressed at paragraph 51.

### Active Travel Issues

- *The school currently meets the needs of the village population. Any pupils attending from the new developments on Llantrisant Road would need to be travel by car as there is no safe walking route into or out of the village for anyone and in any case, it would be too far to expect young children to walk.*
- *Traffic and parking are already a hazard a school pickup and drop off times and the roads into the village are narrow country lanes which are unsuitable for the larger volumes of traffic this proposal would create. This development also conflicts with the Authority's transport policies to encourage people out of their cars and also encouraging pupils to walk or cycle to school. New schools are*

*already built into the Plasdwr development, and it is more appropriate for residents to attend these than put more cars onto narrow country lanes.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

63. Concerns around traffic and transport implications are addressed at paragraphs 12-19.
64. The Council appreciates that not all journeys to the school in a rural area like Pentyrch can be made via active means.
65. There is no safe walking route from the Goitre Fach development. So, the schools transport policy means that the council would supply free home to school transport for those residents. This will be to the nearest school that has room and the type of provision they seek.
66. It is anticipated that those children arriving at Pentyrch Primary School from the development would require one or two vehicles. A designated area immediately outside the school to would be created to allow for these drop offs and pick-ups.

### Wish to retain village identity

- *The local children who attend Pentyrch nursery are the ones that the village will one day expect to respect, maintain and look after the village and to maintain its core values and future and to keep it as a village rather than a small town outside of Cardiff that has lost its identity, as so many 'villages' around Cardiff already have. As parents we want our children to have a village to be proud of and to want to raise their own children there, however if we as a village aren't careful, we will be engulfed by decisions that have been made for profit reasons only and will lose all the parts that make Pentyrch special.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

67. The proposal would support the 21st Century Schools Programme Vision for Cardiff which aims to have schools of the right size and in the right place. It seeks to place schools at the heart of their communities with a shared responsibility for all children and young people.
68. With 140 pupil places, Pentyrch Primary School would be the smallest school in Cardiff. Balancing the budget for a small school is especially difficult. An increased number of pupils attending the school would also allow for a stronger budget position, greater opportunities for pupils and staff and would support the school to maintain and continue to build on its excellent standards.

### Current school buildings

- *Need to see a proposal for the building. In Council's own estimate the building is not adequate, are the plans to build a new school?*
- *A new building on the current site would be amazing. Demountables are still in use which were in use during the 80's.*

### **Appraisal of views expressed**

69. New school places funded through S106 contributions will either be provided through the expansion of existing schools (where a site is capable of accommodating additional pupil places), or through the provision of new build schools.

70. The s106 funding already secured for Pentyrch Primary School will allow the expansion of the school through additional building works and/ or adaptations to the existing school building. This will be considered in more detail at the design stage if the proposal is progressed.

71. Any detailed school design or site layout would be considered at the pre-planning and planning application stages, should the proposal be progressed. There would be opportunities to comment on detailed plans at this stage.

72. Any design taken forward for this proposal would be developed to ensure the delivery of high-quality modern facilities. Detailed designs would be agreed with the Headteacher and Governing Body.